

Frame semantics and verbal constructions: GIVE from a cross-linguistic perspective

Myriam Bouveret

LaTTiCe-ENS

Project funded by the Labex TransferS ENS-Paris

Laboratoire d'excellence TransferS (programme Investissements d'avenir ANR-10-IDEX-0001-02 PSL et ANR-10-LABX-0099)

The aim of the project

- A Cross-linguistic study in two parts: we gather individual studies at first on 7 languages then start the comparative research based on a Max Planck style of elicitations (cf. CUT and BREAK, RECIPROCALS) and comparable corpora. Stages b and c start in September 2014
- Bring new languages in the study
- Have a closer look at the organization of the category: family resemblances, centrality and extensions, bounderies with neighbour families, radial polysemy?
- Compare frames and constructions

Verb classes (Levin 1993)

- (9) The English dative alternation: Pat gave Sam a pear./Pat gave a pear to Sam.
- give VERBS: give, pass, hand, sell, pay, trade, lend, loan
- VERBS OF FUTURE HAVING: advance, allocate, allot, allow, assign, award, bequeath, forward, grant, guarantee, leave, offer, promise
- send VERBS: mail, send, ship
- throw VERBS: fling, flip, kick, lob, shoot, slap, throw, toss
- VERBS OF CONTINUOUS CAUSATION OF ACCOMPANIED MOTION IN A DEICTICALLY SPECIFIED DIRECTION: bring, take

I. Why Give?

- Emile Benveniste, 1951, Le don et l'echange dans les vocabulaires indoeuropeens,
- Basic level category in human cognition (Rosch) and basic activity in children studies (Tomasello), basic event in our cultures (Reesink)
- Basic as part of the core vocabulary (Goldberg and Tomasello, Newman citing Ogden,)
- Extremely polysemic (a wide cline of meanings from concrete giving to a « copula verb », e.g in German)
- productive verb (e. g serial verbs in Kalam, light/support verb in many languages), derivatives e.g. seven derivative nouns in French profile the agent, the object, or the recipient: donneur 'donor', donation 'deed', dotation 'endowment', don 'gift', dote 'dowry', donne 'deal', donataire 'donee'.
- A wide range of constructions (e.g English, French), of case frames (e.g all the ditransitive case frames in Kayardild)

A universal three-place predicate? (Evans and Levinson 2009)

- This event involves a GIVER, a GIFT and a RECIPIENT.
 But is it always a three place predicate?
- Does give always have three arguments? (arguments, as opposed to adjuncts)
- According to Reesink in a survey of 87 Papuan languages, GIVE is NOT universal as three-place predicate

Give in Kayardild

Frame NO.	Theme	Goal	Approx.meaning
1	Obj (MOD)	Location (LOC/MOD)	Pass OBJ to LOC, Put OBJ at/in LOC.
2	PROP	OBJ (MOD)	Give PROP (important gift of
			information) to OBJ; implies
			contractual exchange
3	OBJ (MOD)	VD	Give OBJ/PROP for immediate
			benefit of VD
4	PROP	VD	Give OBJ/PROP for immediate
			benefit of VD; implies regular
			minor obligation.
5	VDON	OBJ	Give VDON to OBJ out of kindness

Figure 9-2 in Evans 1995:234

A great variety of syntactic constructions, e.g. French

- Direct Transitive direct: (AGENT) donner un livre à Jean (give a book to john)
- (SOURCE) l' hématome de la surrénale peut être volumineux et donner (produces/results in) un syndrome de masse qui refoule et abaisse le rein. The most common Give construction in medical corpora
- Indirect Transitive:
 - La fenêtre donner sur l'Ocean Pacifique ('the window overlooks) the ocean'), donner a penser, 'make us think')
- Intransitive:
 - le pommier a bien donné/a donné des pommes ('the apple-tree produced apples')
 - ça donne ('it's fun', coll.)
- Passive: être donné pour connaisseur '(be given as a connoisseur')
- Impersonnal: ça donner ça ('it leads to')
- Reflexive: se donner à une tâche ('to work hard')

Es gibt in German (Newman 1997: 307)

Two Geben constructions in German:

• 1. Ich gebe dem Kind einen Apfel.

NOM
 DAT
 ACC

'I gave the child an apple'

• 2. Es gibt einen Gott.

• NOM ACC

- 'There is a/one God'.
 - Construction strongly established in the 16th century (the writer Fischart translation 'll y a" constructions in Gargantua, but first documented in Sachs ?1544)
 - Meaning of 'leads to, produce, gives rise to' (Newman 1997: 307)

es gibt/ist einen Buch auf dem Tisch

Valence

- Three-Place predicate: Give is centrally ditransitive as a transfer verb, but ditransitive should include not just recipient but Place either (Kalam, Kayardild, French, Romanian, Catalan)
- Two place predicate (es gibt GER) 'there is'; l'arbre donne des fruits (FR) 'The tree produces fruits')
- One place predicate (ça donne (FR)' it's fun')

II. Questions

- 1) Give as a three place-predicate?
- 2) One or several central meanings?
- 3) Is the cultural dimension a frame in the GIVE concept?
- 4) Should we just study the *give* verb crosslinguistically or extend to a more broadly GIVE concept related to a TRANSFER construction (semantics of the verb and semantics of the category)?

- 2 strong meanings are evidenced in the cultural practices and in the syntax of the Papuan languages
- (a) GIVE-PUT and (b) GIVE-EXCHANGE

- Evidence for (a) is provided in Kalam
- Evidence for (b) is provided in Papuan languages and different other languages, e.g. Kayardild, Japanese

Two strong clusters: the central « deictic » and the social ones

- TRANSFER and SOCIAL COMMUNICATION, the second meaning is not derived from the first one
- The meaning TRANSFER is present in all the constructions either concrete or abstract whereas the meaning SOCIAL COMMUNICATION appears only a) in certain languages (e.g. Arabic, Japanese, Kiyardile, Saliba) and etymologically in the history of the meaning (e.g. French and the derivations (don, dote, donation, ordonner, ordonnance, pardonner)

- FRAME (1)
- Deictic: Something like: « an ACCOMPANIED MOTION IN A DEICTICALLY SPECIFIED DIRECTION (cf Levin 2011) » (true as well for give a slap, give a kiss give an advice). : TRANSFER OF GOODS OR INFORMATIONS, TRANSFER OF POSSESSION, TRANSFER OF POSITION
- FRAME (2)
- Social: in this frame there is a presupposition (just like in judgment verbs, see Fillmore) as a PREGIVING frame. Transaction verbs, give-exhange verbs,
- CONSEQUENCES ON SEMANTIC DIMENSIONS AND THE METHODOLOGY: the semantic dimensions are related not only to the verb give, but to the GIVE category and the GIVE concept including GIVE-Put and GIVE-EXCHANGE

In study: Which Semantic dimensions?

- GIVING: GIVER, THEME, RECIPIENT
 - FROM HAND TO HAND (close location)
- DIRECTION: SOURCE, GOAL
- AGENT WILLINGNESS
- (THE RECIPIENT HAS IT IN ITS HAND)
- CHANGE IN THE RECIPIENT
- CLOSENESS BETWEEN SOURCE AND GOAL
- CAUSATION: AN EVENT CAUSES A RESULT (different from move but similar to put)
- PRE-GIVING: ANY PREREQUISITE TO THE EVENT (circumstances). « The stage of giving just before the Donor discontinues possession of the Theme, yielding it to the Recipient. » (FrameNet)

3 meanings

- We propose to examine 3 meanings instead of talking about extensions but the centrality of the category is still Giving; The mental representation is PROVIDE for the whole category.
- The centrality of the category is concrete, ditransitive, 'from hand to hand' with extensions towards concrete and abstract meanings, metaphors and metonymies (cf. Newman 1996)
 - (give a slap, give a bath (provide yourself as the giver of the bath with your hands *give a shower) give an information/a class)

GIVING frame

- CENTRAL
 - Concrete meaning
 - GIVER

THEME RECIPIENT

- Inherits from the Transfer category
 - Recipient/Location/Recipient+Direction

DIRECTIONAL frame

e.g. in Japanese relative status of giver and recipient determines whether the giving is 'upwards' or 'downwards' (Reesink 2011) KUDASARU (1) SASHIAGERU (2)

```
• 1. Watashi wa sensei ni hon
```

I TOPIC teacher DAT camera

sahiage-mashita

give-PAST

'I gave the teacher a book)

2. Sensei ga watashi ni hon o kudasai-mashita

teacher NOM me DAT camera ACC give-PAST

'The teacher gave me a book'

(Newman 1996)

PLACE/LOCATION

- The LOCATIVE RELATION frame is found in the intransitive French donner sur ('give over' overlook), in the Catalan donar l'esquena ('give the back' turn one's back) and in the Romanian constructions a da peste ceva/cineva ('give over smth/smb' come across smth/smb), a da (in)spre/catre/la ('give towards' overlook).
- The CAUSE MOTION and LOCATIVE RELATION frames are illustrated by an intriguing Romanian example, Dăte jos/ la o parte ('give yourself towards down/at a side' get down/go away) but not *Dă-te sus ('give yourself towards up' go up).

CAUSATION Frame cause direction, cause result

- The meaning of 'causation', essential in give, is profiled in the CAUSATIVE (dar un beso (sp.)/ fer un petó (cat.) 'give a kiss') and CAUSATION SCENARIO frames in 'give + illness feeling', and also in 'verb + infinitive' constructions (donar que pensar (sp.), fer pensar (cat.) 'make one think'), where the source is an institution assigning a deontic value to the verb behaving like a semi-auxiliary.
- Semi auxiliary of causation in French/English: give to + INF + knowledge verbs
- G ñ in Kalam

IV. Examples in several Papuan languages

Give in Kalam

• Ñ . Transitive verb. Move a thing into close-fitting and stable contact with another object or surface. CAUSE DIRECTION CLOSE POSITION

• Give, transfer something into someone's possession (direct object the thing given, indirect object the recipient). Transitive verb.

```
 1. Leo yalk-nup tu ñak
 Leo Yalk-him axe give-3SG-PAST
 SUB
```

(Pawley and Bulmer 2011)

^{&#}x27;Leo gave an axe to Yalk'

Give-Put

- Connect, fit, fix or screw a thing in place.
 - 4. Cpl ñan!lid connect/fit on-2SG.IMP
 - 'Put the lid on!'
- (usually g ñ-) Apply or put something to a surface (grinding an adze, filling a blade, washing or soaping something, putting or paint or decorations, putting a burning stick to s.th.)
 - 5. Bopl ag-i, sup ñ-n-k.
 - Chip burn-SS.PRIOR torch apply-1SG-PAST

'Having lit a chip, I put the reed-torch to it (in order to set fire to the torch)

(Pawley and Bulmer 2011:translation revised)

Other meanings

• (in g ñ-) Close (an entrance, door).

6. Katam

g

ñan.

• Door

do

connect-2SG.IMP

CAUSE

'close the entrance!'

• Arrange something or position something in orderly fashion. Transitive verb.

• 7. Kopyak-gon

pag

ñ-n-m

akay?

rat-trap

bend

fix-should-1SG

where

• 'Where should I set the rat-trap?'

• (pag ñ- bend connect/fit = bend back the catch and set the trigger)

• Rest something on or against a supporting surface.

• 8. Ñayp

at

ñ-e-k

mdp.

Knife

on.top

rest-3SG

stay-PF.3SG

'He rested the bush-knife to rest on it'

PUT-DIRECTION

(Pawley and Bulmer 2011-gloses revised)

Give in Nen

• Warams , ditransitive verb. give.

1. Ta qarama!

IMPERFECTIVE

'You give it to me!'

2. Ymam wagib

3SG.ERG

ta 1SG.OBL wa-rama/nda

3SGA>1SGU.P.PF-

BENgive

PERFECTIVE

fish (ABS)

'She gave me a fish

Nicholas Evans data

3. Ymam warama/nda

ta

ämbs

3sg-ER

3sgA>1sgU.FV.PSTgive

1sgOBL one

pus nne ämbs

six yam one

PERFECTIVE

'He gave me seven yams'

In 2 and 3 Recipient is marked on the verb but not the theme

4. Ynd tande mleg bä gnarama, de bm wnde bende mleg geä qnarama / qarama. IMPERFECTIVE

I'll give you my sister, if you give me your sister in return (some time later / on the spot). (Evans N., Lexicon in Grammar of Nen, in preparation)

Sister exchange practice in the Morehead district

- E.g of the exogamy network In the town of Rouku
- A) Two men having a sister (a real one or someone from the same clan) can exchange them.
- B) Only one of the two men has a sister and as a downpayment the other man offers usually Yams. He might have to live in the girl's village until he can provide an exchange with a sister.

Mary Clifton Ayres, 1983

without sister exchange

- C) a woman can be exchanged as a past debt. This debt of owing can last a generation
- karata trp, noun

girl born to a man who contracted a marriage

by downpayment of food (without sister exchange),

who will be given as his exchange to release him

from the obligation to live with her clan.

(Evans N., Lexicon in Grammar of Nen, in preparation)

Morehead-Maro family

« Nen and Kómnzo are each spoken by about a hundred people in villages in the Western Province of PNG. (...)

They belong to the Morehead-Maro family (20 languages located in New Guinea). »

see DOBES poster project

Give in Saliba

- Saliba is a Western Oceanic language of the Suauic family that belongs to the Papuan tip Cluster
- Spoken by about 1,000 people on Saliba Island at the Eastern tip of Papua New Guinea
- « Saliba is a nominative-accusative and head-marking language with SOV word order for lexical elements.
 The verb obligatorily carries a subject prefix and, if it is transitive, an object suffix. » (Margetts, 2011:111) (Monash University)

Saliba

- 1st or 2nd person RECIPIENT. Always encodes the THEME of the transfer with the object prefix. Transitive verb.
 - Two distinct verbs: le 'give' and hai 'take/get'

```
1. Bosa kesega ye le-ya-ma
```

basket one 3SG give-3SG.O-hither

'He gave me/us one basket'

2. Bosa kesega ye le-ya-ma

basket one 3SG give-3SG.O-addr

'He gave you one basket'

Case marking of the subjet and the object on the verb, not the recipient

A suppletive paradigm le/mose-

- 3rd person RECIPIENT. Can encode the THEME with the object prefix or the RECIPIENT.
 - One verb: mose-i 'give'
 - 3. Bosa kesega ye mose-i-Ø basket one 3SG give-APP-3SG.O 'He gave him/her one basket.'
 - 4. Bosa kesega ye mose-i-di basket one 3SG give-APP-3PL.O 'He gave them one basket.'

Case marking

• The recipient in 3 and 4 is syntactically encoded (whereas not in 1 and 2) as an object argument by the pronominal suffix on the verb.

- The recipient is encoded as an object argument by the pronominal suffix on the verb, « them » occurs as a second object
 - RECIPIENT marked as an APP in 3 and 4, a participant

'He loads hay on the wagon.'

Saliba. Semantics: 'transfer' 'deixis' versus 'permanency'

- Both verbs can express temporary transfer of the theme.
- Permanency of transfer can explicitly be expressed with the verbs kainauya-i 'give a gift', duwa-i 'give in exchange for help', and kune 'exchange important gifts'. These terms can be considered non nuclear expressions of 'giving', whereas both le and mose-i are nuclear expressions (Dixon, 1982)

Papuan Languages (Reesink 2012)

(Survey of 72 Papuan languages, 33 belonging to the Trans New Guinea family, 39 of various non-TNG lineages

GIVE in two perspectives

Survey of 33 TNG languages:

- 1) Recipient marked as DO on the verb
- 2) GiFT as DO, Recipient as oblique
- 1) HUMAN INTERACTION = Recipient as DO
- 2) OBJECT MANIPULATION = Gift as DO

• Results:

- Only 3 out of 33 (Kaluli, Suena and Wambon) are Type
 2, OBJECT MANIPULATION, Gift is the only choice for
 DO
- « It follows that these languages are counter-examples to the claim that 'give' verbs have always three arguments. » (Reesink 2012)

Menya (TNG)

- Ditransitive: Recipient indexed by prefix:
- I=qu qawa hn=qu=aqu
- that=M taro INDEF=M=CL
- 'He gave the two of us two taros.'
- qe ä-ya-tap-k-qäqä=i CERT ASS-1DL.OBJ-give-PA/PFV-3S/DSO=IND (Whitehead 2004:95 in Reesink 2012))
- ?Menya agrees with a number of other (Papuan) languages in marking the BENEFICIARY on the verb. The suffix ---i is apparently the form used for third person recipient 'give':

Gizrra (Non-TNG)

• (1) Wa kü-rü katam k(ü)-lión-órr. 3SG.SUBJ 1SG-GEN banana 1SG.OBJgive.PL-3SG.PAST

'He gave me bananas.' (Van Bodegraven 2004:25, ex. (73b))

Human Interaction perspective as only option in non-TNG

Papuan Languages

- The island of New Guinea is a region of spectacular, deep linguistic diversity. It contains roughly 850 languages, which on present evidence fall into at least 18 language families that are not demonstrably related, along with several isolates. (...) Among the non-Austronesian families of New Guinea one family stands out for its large membership and wide geographic spread: Trans New Guinea (TNG). With a probable membership of between 300 and 500 discrete languages, plus hundreds of highly divergent dialects, TNG is among most numerous of the world's language families. T *Ethnologue* (Lewis et al. 2013) gives the following estimates for major language families: Niger-Congo (1524), Austronesian (1221), Trans New Guinea (475), Sino-Tibetan (456), Indo-European (436), Afro-Asiatic (366). These estimates are problematic for a number of reasons but give a rough idea.
- A case can be made for associating the initial dispersal of TNG languages with the spread of agriculture through the major valleys of the highlands perhaps between 10,000 and 6,000 years ago (see section 8).

(Pawley and Hammarström, in submission)

V. Give in French

Is Central meaning the first meaning attested?

Is Central meaning the most frequent one?

- Donner 'give' as first meaning attested in a written text in 842 in Les Serments de Strasbourg, is linked to mental attributes like power or strength (ATILF, 2007).
- The concrete meaning of *donner* is attested later in French during the second half of the tenth century with objects referring to physical gifts like a dowry,
- Attested then later (1050), related to donations like alms (ib.).
- The concrete GIVING meaning of *donner* has a very low frequency in our three corpora in a search out of the first 500 restults for each (12.75% in corpus A (word sketch engine, webcorpus), 8% in corpus B (Frantext litterature) and 0% in corpus C (Le Monde 2002: newspaper).

Attested: Transitive meaning as the most frequent one (87.3%) transitive verbs out of 600 examples (3 corpora: Le Monde 1987, Frantext, oral corpAix). (Willems 2005)

VI. Perspectives

- The cross-linguistic study :
 - Elicitations for concrete meanings verb classes, categories and extensions GIVE/PUT and GIVE/EXCHANGE
 - Comparable corpora for non concrete and metaphorical meaning
 - Story telling ?
- Study the polysemy in each corpus and the frames and constructions for every language in the study
- Develop the study of categorization « Family resemblances» (Rosch)
- Collect data from the Morehead district and compare the cultural practices about transactions, give exchange practices, GIVE concept and give verb classes

THANK YOU!

References to be completed see ANNEXE 1

- Pbenveniste, 1951, Presses universitaires de France. *Emile Benveniste*, "*Don* et *echange* dans le vocabulaire *indo-europeen*," Problemes de linguistique generale (Paris: Gallimard, 1966).
- Pawley et al. Dictionnary
- Pawley, A., & Hammarström, H. (in press). The Trans New Guinea family. In B. Palmer (Ed.), Papuan Languages and Linguistics. Berlin: De Gruyter. Evans et al. 2011
- Evans and Levinson BEHAVIORAL AND BRAIN SCIENCES (2009) 32, 429–492
- Wierzbicka
- Newman 1996, 1998
- Reesink 2012
- Margetts 2011